

Student handout: a claim needs evidence

Original classroom text | Name: _____

1. The classroom clock stopped just before the science fair opened.
2. Mina checked the battery drawer. It was empty.
3. She borrowed a clock from the office and placed it beside the display.
4. When a younger pupil spilled water, Mina moved the paper labels out of the puddle.
5. She handed him a towel and said, "We can fix this before the visitors arrive."
6. By opening time, the display was dry and the borrowed clock was ticking.

Read the numbered text. Claim: Mina responds constructively when something goes wrong.

A. Choose TWO different actions that support the claim. Give each line number.

Evidence 1: _____

This supports the claim because: _____

Evidence 2: _____

This supports the claim because: _____

B. Does line 1 alone show that Mina is helpful? Explain.

C. Exit ticket: Choose one line that shows Mina helps another person. Explain how the line supports your answer.

Extension: Write a different defensible claim and select a line to support it.

Teacher key and a 40-minute route

Objective: Given the six-line text, students select two relevant actions, cite their line numbers, and explain how each supports the claim.

Materials: one student sheet per learner, pencils, and a displayed copy of the text. This is an original example; match the reading demand to your class.

Hook (3 min): “Does a problem tell us what a character is like, or do we need to see their response?”

Model (7 min): Use line 3. Mina finds an alternative instead of giving up. Link the action explicitly to the claim.

Guided practice (10 min): Pairs explain why line 4 is evidence. Ask what would change if she simply watched the water spread.

Independent practice (12 min): Complete A and B without a partner. Accept paraphrases with accurate line references.

Assessment (5 min): Complete C independently. Separate evidence choice from explanation quality.

Closure (3 min): Students finish “A useful quotation supports my claim because...”

Key: A accepts lines 3, 4, or 5 when the explanation connects the action to responding constructively. Two quotations from the same action are not two distinct examples. B: No; line 1 describes the problem but says nothing about Mina’s response. C: Lines 4 or 5 can support helping the younger pupil.

Review each evidence pair: relevant action (1), accurate line (1), explanation linking it to the claim (1). Two pairs: 6 points. Keep B and the exit ticket as separate checks.

Follow-up: inaccurate reference -> practice locating a line; relevant quote without explanation -> model “This shows...because...”; secure reasoning -> compare two defensible claims.

Support: read the text aloud and provide the explanation stem. Extension: ask whether “Mina always solves every problem” goes beyond the available evidence.